

### Annexure-A

	Comments / Suggest	and condition	ns of tariff) R	egulations, 2	024		
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Provision details Comments / suggestions				
1	33. Depreciation	(10) (11) Depreciation of the emission	It is pertinent	to mention h	ere that existi	ing generating	
		control system of an existing generating	station like A	PNRL, who a	chieved its C	OD for unit-1	
		station that is yet to complete its useful life	and unit-2 on	21.01.2013 a	and 19.05.201	3 has already	
		or a new generating station or unit thereof	completed the	e life of 11 yea	ars from its us	seful life of 25	
		where the date of operation of the	years, which	means only	14 years of	useful life is	
		emission control system is subsequent to	remaining.				
		the date of commercial operation of the	As per the t	imeline provi	ded by the I	MOEFCC the	
		generating station or unit thereof, shall be	e APNRL has to comply with the emission norms before				
		computed annually from the date of the 31.12.2026, which implies that at the			lies that at th	the COD of the	
		operation of such emission control system	ation of such emission control system emission control system the remaining useful			seful life will	
		based on the straight line method at rates	be 12 years.				
		specified in Appendix- I to these	The timeline	provided by	the MOEF	CC is shown	
		regulations;	below:				
	"Provided that the remaining			Location /	Timelines fo	r compliance	
		depreciable value as on 31st March of the year closing after a period of 12 years		Area	Non retiring	Retiring	
				Within 101	units	units 21 st	
		from the date of operation of such	Category A	Within 10 km radius of	Upto 31st December	Upto 31st December	
		emission control system shall be spread		National	2022	2022	



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024					
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details		Comments /	suggestions	
		over the balance period of thirteen years		Capital		
		or balance operational life of generating		Region or		
		station, whichever is lower."		cities having		
		station, whichever is tower.		million plus		
				population <sup>1</sup>		
			Category B	Within 10 km	Upto 31st	Upto 31st
				radius of	December	December
				Critically	2023	2025
				Polluted		
				Areas <sup>2</sup> or		
				Non-		
				attainment		
				cities <sup>2</sup>		
			Category C <sup>3</sup>	Other than	Upto 31st	Upto 31st
				these	December	December
				included in	2024	2026
				category A		
				and B		
			<sup>1</sup> As per 2011 ce	ensus of India		
			<sup>2</sup> As defined by	СРСВ		
			<sup>3</sup> APNRL comes	under the catego	ory C	
			The Regulation	on specify the	first 12 years	s of operation
			of emission	control syster	n, the deprec	ciation of the



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions	
			system shall be computed annually from the date of	
			operation of emission system based on the straight line	
			method at rates specified in Appendix-I in the	
			regulations (i.e., 5.28 % for plant & machineries),	
			which means upto 12 years the 63% of the capital cost	
			of the system will be depreciated and accordingly,	
			APNRL shall not be able to recover the full assest	
			depreciation in the plant operational life.	
			In addition to the above, A. Clause 6.2 (5) of the	
			Tariff Policy, 2016, provides that such thermal power	
			plants (TPP) which are situated within a 50 km radius	
			of the Sewage Treatment Plants (STPs), operated by	
			municipalities or similar organizations are to	
			mandatorily utilize treated sewage water from such	
			STPs. Furthermore, the associated costs incurred on	
			account of such utilization (such as construction of	
			pipeline from STP to TPP) shall be allowed as a pass-	
			through in the tariff.	
			Subsequently, Ministry of Power (MoP) vide its letter	
			dated 04.03.2020 (attached as Annexure 2) issued	



Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions
			detailed instructions regarding the mandatory usage of
			the treated sewage water by the Power producers, cost
			to be incurred by the Utilities as well as Power
			producers and the mechanism for the recovery of
			the associated cost therein. Herein it was provided
			that the cost of the Tertiary Treatment Plant
			("TTP") and associated facilities such as pipeline,
			pumps etc. to be borne by the thermal power plants.
			The current draft regulation is not specifying how the
			equipment associated with Tertiary Treatment Plant
			will be depreciated.
			Considering the above grounds and making the balance
			between interest of end consumers / beneficiaries and
			reasonable recovery of cost for the generating station,
			APNRL suggest that the depreciable value (i.e., 90% of
			the capital cost) of the emission control system and STP
			shall be spread over the balance operational life of the
			generating station.
2	34 Interest on	(a) For Coal-based / lignite-fired thermal	It is pertinent to mention here that as per the current
	Working Capital	generating stations:	draft Regulation, the generating station can levy the late



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024				
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions		
		(i)	payment surcharge as specified in the MoP- Electricity		
			(Late Payment Surcharge and Related Matters) Rules,		
		(vi) Receivables equivalent to 45 days	2022 in case the non-payment of charges beyond a		
		of capacity charge and energy charge	period of 45 days from the date of presentation of bills.		
		for the sale of electricity calculated on	Further it is also specifying that in case a different LPS		
		the normative annual plant	mechanism is provided in the PPA, the same shall be		
		availability factor;	governed by the provisions of the PPA. The related		
			excerpt from the draft regulation is reproduced herein		
			below:		
			"80. Late payment surcharge: In case the payment of		
			any bill for charges payable under these regulations is		
			delayed by a beneficiary or long term customer as the		
			case may be, beyond a period of 45 days from the date		
			of presentation of bills, a late payment surcharge as		
			specified in the Ministry of Power – Electricity (Late		
			Payment Surcharge and Related Matters) Rules, 2022		
			as amended from time to time shall be levied by the		
			generating company or the transmission licensee, as		
			the case may be.		



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024				
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions		
			Provided that in case a different LPS		
			mechanism is provided in the PPA, the same		
			shall be governed by the provisions of the		
			PPA."		
			Considering the example of the PPA executed between		
			the APNRL and JBVNL (Jharkhand Bijli Vitran Nigam		
			Limited) dated 28.09.2012. The clause 8.3.4 of the said		
			PPA specify:		
			" 8.3.5 In the event of delay in payment of a Monthly		
			Bill by Procurer beyond 60 days from the date of		
			billing, a Late Payment Surcharge shall be payable by		
			such Procurer to the Seller at the rate of 1.25% per		
			month"		
			Considering the provision related to late payment		
			surcharge specified in the draft regulation, in case the		
			LPS mechanism is different in PPA the provision of		
			PPA will be governed. Consequently, the APNRL can		
			levy the LPS to the JBVNL in case of non-payment of		
			charges beyond a period of 60 days from the date of		
			presentation of bills.		



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions	
			It is crucial to mention here that as per the Regulation	
			34 (a) outlines the components considered for	
			determining the working capital requirement for coal-	
			based generating stations. Among these components is	
			the inclusion of receivables equivalent to 45 days of	
			capacity charges and energy charges for the sale of	
			electricity, calculated based on the Normative Annual	
			Plant Availability Factor.	
			Working capital is provided to generators to effectively	
			handle their operations during a specific period since	
			there is usually a time lag between billing and payment	
			recovery. In this context, working capital is allocated	
			for a designated timeframe. However, if the beneficiary	
			fails to make payment for the bills within that	
			timeframe, the generator is entitled to charge a Late	
			Payment Surcharge (LPS) in addition to the bill	
			amount. As a result, these two tariff components are	
			closely intertwined and interconnected.	
			Hence, the APNRL is suggesting the following change	
			in the Regulation 34(a)(vi):	



	Comments / Suggesti	ions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms	and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions
			"(vi) Receivables equivalent to 45 days or days
			specified in the PPA, whichever is earlier, beyond
			which late payment surcharge shall be levied of
			capacity charge and energy charge for the sale of
			electricity calculated on the normative annual plant
			availability factor"
3	36 Operation and	(9) The operation and maintenance	It has been stated above that as per the direction
	Maintenance	expenses on account of emission control	received from the MoP, the generating stations like
	Expenses	systems in coal or lignite based thermal	APNRL which are situated within a 50 km radius of the
		generating stations shall be 2% of the	Sewage Treatment Plants (STPs), will have to
		admitted capital expenditure (excluding	mandatorily utilize the sewage treated water and for
		IDC and IEDC) as on its date of	that the Tertiary Treatment Plant will build at the
		operation, which shall be escalated	location of thermal generating station and cost of
		annually @ 5.89% during the tariff period	operation will be borne by the generating station.
		ending on 31st March 2029:	Consequently, the O&M expenses for the generating
		Provided that income generated from the	station will increase. The current draft regulation is not
		sale of gypsum or other by-products shall	specifying any O&M cost for operating the Tertiary
		be reduced from the operation and	Treatment Plant in order to fulfil the directives of MoP.
		maintenance expenses.	Hence, it is requested to this Hon'ble Commission to
			provide the norms for O&M expenses related to using



	Comments / Suggesti	ions from APNRL on Draft	t CERC (terms	and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision deta	ils	Comments / suggestions
				the sewage treated water similarly as provided for
				emission control system.
4	70. Norms of	(E) Auxiliary Energy Cons	umption:	The current draft regulation specifies the norms for
	operation for	(a)		Auxiliary Consumption for the emission control
	thermal generating			system. Similarly, it is requested to specify the norms
	station			for Auxiliary Consumption for operating the Tertiary
		(f) Norms of Auxil	iary energy	Treatment Plant as generating station like APNRL is
		consumption for the em	ission control	obligated to use sewage treated water as mentioned
		system (AUX <sub>en</sub> ) of therm	al generating	earlier.
		stations:		
			AUXen (as %	
		Name of Technology	of gross	
		For reduction of emission of Su	generation)	
		a) Wet Limestone based	upnur aioxiae:	
		FGD system (without	1.0%	
		Gas to Gas heater)		
5	76. Billing and	(1)	<u> </u>	Within the country, a number of thermal power stations
	Payment of charges:	(2) Payment of the capacit	y charge for a	are obligated to supply a part of their capacity only on
		thermal generating station s	shall be shared	a variable charge to the home state without getting any
		by the beneficiaries of t	he generating	



	Comments / Suggesti	ions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms	and conditions of tariff) R	egulations, 2024	
Sl No	Draft Regulation No Provision details		Comments / suggestions		
Sl No			Comments /	suggestions port from the home state. A	
		the capacity corresponding to free energy to home State.	Vedanta Ltd. (Jharsuguda)  Jindal India Thermal Power Ltd.	(home state)  5% / 7% net capacity only on a variable cost to Odisha (home state)  12% net capacity only on a variable cost to Odisha (home state)	



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024				
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions		
			The above scenario can be compare with hydro		
			generating stations, where these plants also need to		
			provide some share of power as free energy to home		
			state as per Central government hydro policy.		
			In case of hydro generating stations, Regulation		
			provides the recovery of capacity charge from		
			"saleable capacity". The Saleable capacity is		
			determined after deducting the capacity corresponding		
			to free energy to home state.		
			On the similar grounds as of hydro generating stations,		
			it is requested to this Hon'ble Commission to revise the		
			Regulation 76 (2) as following:		
			"Payment of the capacity charge for a thermal		
			generating station shall be shared by the beneficiaries		
			of the generating station as per their percentage		
			shares for the month (inclusive of any allocation out		
			of the unallocated capacity) in the saleable capacity of		
			the generating station (to be determined after		
			deducting the capacity corresponding to energy only		
			on a variable cost to home state)"		



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions	
6	Allow discount		The Ministry of Coal (MoC), under the SHAKTI	
	offered under		(Scheme to Harness and Allocate Koyla Transparently	
	SHAKTI Scheme as		in India), has effectively established a mechanism for	
	a pass through in		the allocation of long-term coal linkages to power	
	tariff		plants lacking fuel supply agreements (FSAs) through	
			coal auctions.	
			This policy implementation can be construed as the	
			promulgation of an Indian law, thereby as per the draft	
			CERC Tariff Regulation 2024, SHAKTI Scheme can	
			be considered as a "Change in Law."	
			"13) 'Change in Law' means occurrence of any of the	
			following events:	
			(a) enactment, bringing into effect or promulgation	
			of any new Indian law;"	
			In the matter of Maharashtra State Electricity	
			Distribution Company Limited Vs Adani Power	
			Maharashtra Limited and another, the Hon'ble	
			Supreme Court of India has deemed the SHAKTI	
			scheme as a "Change in Law". The relevant excerpt	
			from the judgement again reproduced herein below:	



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions	
			"22. It can thus be seen that this Court has held that if	
			there is a Change in any consent, approval or licence	
			available or obtained for the project, otherwise than	
			for the default of the seller, which results in any change	
			in any cost of the business of selling electricity, then the	
			said seller will be governed under Clause 13.1.1 of	
			the PPA. As already discussed hereinabove, this Court	
			has consistently held that modification to NCDP 2007	
			by the communication dated 31st July 2013 would	
			amount to Change in Law and the generating	
			companies would be entitled to compensation on	
			account of such Change in Law. Undisputedly,	
			SHAKTI Policy also reduces the ACQ as was assured	
			under the 2007 NCDP. Consequently, SHAKTI Policy	
			will also have to be held to be Change in Law."	
			(Emphasis Supplied)"	
			It is pertinent to mention here that, in the multiple cases,	
			where Change in Law is approved, the economic	
			position prior to bid due date has been protected by the	



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024		
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions
			judgement of the Hon'ble Supreme Court / APTEL /
			CERC.
			Accordingly, the bidders under Section-63 have been
			getting pass through of additional cost which
			eventually protects their returns from the generation
			business.
			In the current regime, the tariff elements do not give
			any cognizance to discount offered under SHAKTI
			Scheme. It may be noted that the beneficiaries of power
			get an assured reliable supply of power using Shakti
			coal. For projects under Section-62, the fuel cost is
			allowed as a pass-through. Therefore, there was no
			obligation as such on generating companies to apply for
			coal under SHAKTI by offering discount.
			However, with the objective of safeguarding the
			interests of beneficiaries and ensuring a reliable long
			term coal supply, the generating stations are voluntarily
			procuring coal under the SHAKTI Scheme.
			Currently, the entirety of the benefit derived from the
			SHAKTI Scheme is being passed through to long-term



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions	
			procurer i.e. discom, notwithstanding the financial	
			losses incurred by the company which were already	
			struggling with sustainability issues.	
			In the earlier submission for comments / suggestions on	
			"Approach Paper on Terms And Conditions Of Tariff	
			Regulations, 2024 for the tariff period from 01.04.2024	
			to 31.03.2019" (Attached as Annexure-3 herein), the	
			APNRL has already computed that upon providing the	
			SHAKTI discount and non-recovery of capacity charge	
			for 12% of net capacity (i.e., supplied to home state	
			Jharkhand only on variable cost) resulted in the reduced	
			rate of return of ~8% from 15.50%.	
			It is pertinent to note that the APNRL is currently	
			paying interest on debt at an interest rate of 9%, which	
			may increase further in near future. The current interest	
			itself is more than the actual rate of return as stated	
			above.	
			It is important to recognize that a decrease in RoE can	
			greatly discourage and it is worth	



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions	
			mentioning that a considerable number of companies	
			have recently gone bankrupt as a result of financial	
			crises.	
			Hence, considering the above grounds it is requested to	
			this Hon'ble Commission to kindly allow the SHAKTI	
			Scheme discount as a pass-through in the Regulation.	
7	Assuring the	"30. Return on Equity: (1) Return on	As mentioned earlier, In the current regime, the tariff	
	minimal RoE of	equity shall be computed in rupee terms,	elements do not give any cognizance to discount	
	15.5% as per	on the equity base determined in	offered under SHAKTI Scheme. It may be noted that	
	Regulations	accordance with Regulation 18 of these	the beneficiaries of power get an assured reliable	
		regulations.	supply of power using Shakti coal. For projects under	
		(2) Return on equity for existing project	Section-62, the fuel cost is allowed as a pass-through.	
		shall be computed at the base rate of	Therefore, there was no obligation as such on	
		15.50% for thermal generating	generating companies to apply for coal under SHAKTI	
		station,"	by offering discount.	
			Adding to the above, non recovery of fixed charges of	
			power supplied only at variable charges depletes the	
			return which is not in alignment to Section 61 of the	
			Electricity Act 2003 which provides 'safeguarding of	
			consumers' interest and the recovery of electricity costs	



Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions
			in a reasonable manner. The relevant excerpt from the
			Electricity Act is reproduced herein below:
			"Section 61 (Tariff Regulations):
			The Appropriate Commission shall, subject to the
			provisions of this Act, specify the terms and conditions
			for the determination of tariff, and in doing so, shall be
			guided by the following, namely:-
			(a)
			(b)
			(c)
			(d) safeguarding of consumers' interest and at the
			same time, recovery of the cost of electricity in a
			reasonable manner;" (Emphasis Supplied)"
			Similarly, the National Tariff Policy, 2016 states that
			the rate of return should be attractive enough to
			encourage investments comparable to or even
			preferable to other sectors. This
			will ensure that the electricity sector can create
			sufficient capacity. Additionally, the rate



Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions
			of return should be set at a level that allows for the
			generation of a reasonable surplus to
			foster the growth of the sector. The relevant excerpt
			from the policy is reproduced herein
			below:
			"5.11
			a) Return on Investment
			Balance needs to be maintained between the interests
			of consumers and the need for investments while laying
			down rate of return. Return should attract investments
			at par with, if not in preference to, other sectors so that
			the electricity sector is able to create adequate
			capacity. The rate of return should be such that it
			allows generation of reasonable surplus for growth of
			the sector."
			In light of the above argument, it is therefore proposed
			as follows:-
			a. Allow pass-through of SHAKTI discount under
			Tariff elements as a separate cost.



	Comments / Suggestions from APNRL on Draft CERC (terms and conditions of tariff) Regulations, 2024			
Sl No	Draft Regulation No	Provision details	Comments / suggestions	
			b. Allow recovery of fixed charges for power	
			supplied only at a variable cost from the balance	
			quantum of generating station.	
			c. Develop a mechanism similar to 'Change in Law'	
			under the tariff structure, which can acknowledge	
			discounts such as the SHAKTI discount and	
			conditions like a certain share of power being	
			available only at a variable cost to the home state.	
			This way, any financial impact arising due to these	
			conditions/situations can be passed through under	
			the regulatory regime, while ensuring a minimum	
			RoE of 15.50%.	
			It is imperative that the above will help in retaining the	
			returns which will support the financial viability of the	
			station. Given the stress in the thermal sector and	
			several units already under NCLT, a positive	
			consideration will help APNRL to sustain its operation	
			in the long run.	